

The Effectiveness of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) Learning Model Based on Vocabulary Cards to Improve Arabic Speaking Skills

Ade Rizky Hermawan¹, Ainun Syarifah²

^{1,2}Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya

aderizkyhermawan2@gmail.com¹, ainunsyarifah@uinsa.ac.id²

APA Citation:

Hermawan, A. R & Syarifah, A. (2025). The Effectiveness of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) Learning Model Based on Vocabulary Cards to Improve Arabic Speaking Skills. *EDUCASIA*, 10(3), 321-330.
doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21462/educasia.v10.i3.386>

Abstract

This study aims to test the effectiveness of the Think Pair Share (TPS) cooperative learning model combined with vocabulary cards in improving the Arabic speaking skills (*maharah kalam*) of Madrasah Tsanawiyah students. The background of this study stems from the low speaking ability of students due to limited vocabulary, shyness, and a lack of interactive learning methods. This study uses a quantitative approach with a One Group Pretest-Posttest Design, where the research subjects consist of 38 seventh-grade students at MTsN 1 Lamongan. Data were collected through speaking tests before (pretest) and after (posttest) the learning treatment using the TPS model based on vocabulary cards. Data analysis was performed using descriptive statistics and a paired sample t-test. The results of the study showed a significant increase in the average score from 74.39 on the pretest to 89.58 on the posttest, with a difference of 15.19 points. The t-test yielded a value of -8.736 with a significance level of $p = 0.000 (< 0.05)$, confirming that the difference between the pretest and posttest scores is statistically significant. These findings confirm that the implementation of the TPS model based on vocabulary cards is effective in improving students' speaking skills. Pedagogically, this model not only expands vocabulary mastery but also enhances confidence, oral participation, and fluency in speaking. This study recommends that Arabic language teachers in madrasahs can adopt the TPS with vocabulary cards as an alternative contextual, interactive, and enjoyable learning strategy in developing *maharah kalam*.

Keywords: learning model, speaking skills, think pair share (tps), vocabulary cards

1. INTRODUCTION

Arabic is one of the most widely used languages in the world. Due to its widespread use, Arabic has now been recognized internationally and has become one of the official global languages (Sakdiah & Sihombing, 2023). And also, Arabic is one of the foreign languages that has long been studied in Indonesia (Hidayah, 2019), even since the arrival of Islam in the 13th century. As the language of the Qur'an and the primary source of Islamic sciences, Arabic holds a special position in education, particularly in religious institutions such as pesantren, madrasahs, and Islamic universities. Along with the development of the times, Arabic learning is not only aimed at religious purposes, but also at broadening cultural horizons, global communication, and cross-national scientific integration.

Indonesia is a country where the majority of its population is Muslim, which makes religious motives the fundamental reason for learning Arabic (Khasanah, 2016). Moreover, the primary sources of Islamic teachings—namely the Qur'an, Hadith, and the various branches of Islamic scholarship—are written in Arabic. Therefore, it is essential for Muslims, particularly scholars, to study, understand, and master the Arabic language. Without such proficiency, it becomes difficult to examine Islam directly from its original sources in Arabic (Nasution & Lubis, 2023). This establishes religious motivation as one of the most basic reasons for learning Arabic. As the language of the Qur'an and the main source of Islamic teachings, Arabic holds a strategic position in Islamic education in Indonesia, particularly in madrasahs and other Islamic-based educational institutions. The study of Arabic is not only academic or linguistic, but also touches on the spiritual, ideological, and character-building aspects of students.

Over time, the models of Arabic language teaching in Indonesia have experienced significant adjustments and developments following the dynamics of the era. Initially, Arabic learning was mostly traditional, focusing on memorization of grammar rules (*nahwu and sharaf*) and the textual mastery of Qur'anic recitation. However, such models were considered less effective because they tended to be teacher-centered and lacked encouragement for students to be active and communicative. Arabic learning will only be effective if it is relevant to the diverse potentials of students and is able to arouse their interest in learning (Ahmad, 2015). The implementation of appropriate learning strategies can help students achieve higher proficiency in the Arabic language, while also deepening their understanding of Arabic culture and Islamic knowledge (Nuryadin, Irfan, & Layinah, 2024). In recent decades, various efforts have emerged to develop more modern and innovative Arabic teaching models, such as constructivist-based approaches that emphasize active, collaborative, and student-confident learning. This approach shifts the teacher's role from the center of attention to a facilitator, so that students are more directly engaged in the learning process.

Nevertheless, challenges in Arabic learning are still found, especially in developing students' speaking ability, which is often low due to limited vocabulary, shyness, and teaching methods that do not actively involve learners. Therefore, learning innovations that align with the spirit of the Merdeka Curriculum are needed. One relevant approach is the application of the cooperative learning model Think Pair Share (TPS), supported by learning media such as vocabulary cards. The TPS model has proven effective in increasing participation and understanding of students in Arabic learning. This model allows students

to think individually, discuss ideas with their partners, and finally share their findings with the whole class (Isnaini, Safitriani, & Dariyadi, 2024).

In the midst of demands to improve the quality of Arabic learning in madrasahs, various innovative teaching methods have been introduced to address the challenges of low language skills, especially in *maharah kalam* (speaking skills). One model that has received much attention is Think Pair Share (TPS), which has theoretically proven to enhance active participation, critical thinking, and students' speaking confidence. Although theoretically promising, its implementation in the context of madrasahs has not been fully mapped (Isnaini et al., 2024). Many teachers still face obstacles in understanding the systematic steps of TPS application, especially when it has to be adapted to students' characteristics, limited time, and the availability of supporting media. On the other hand, there have been few empirical studies specifically testing the effectiveness of TPS in teaching Arabic at the Madrasah Tsanawiyah level, making it important to conduct research that evaluates and maps its implementation contextually and applicatively.

In the teaching process, media also plays an important role. Media is a means of delivering information from a source, which can take any form that conveys or provides information. Learning media are tools and facilities that help the teaching-learning process so that the intended message becomes clearer and the learning objectives can be achieved effectively and efficiently (Lestari, Rahman, & Asri, 2023). Properly designed media not only make materials clearer and easier to understand, but also increase students' learning interest, which is crucial in creating an interactive and enjoyable learning atmosphere that ultimately encourages optimal learning achievement. Media make abstract information more concrete. Without media, learning tends to be monotonous, overly dependent on explanation, and students quickly get bored. Arabic has its own complexities, especially in mastering vocabulary, which often becomes the main barrier for students.

According to Febrianti, the use of vocabulary cards is expected to provide a solution to students' limited vocabulary knowledge and improve their Arabic speaking skills (Norlianti, Riadi, Sapitri, & Rabiatal Aliyah, 2024). Students often have grammatical knowledge (*nahwu and sharaf*) but struggle to express words. This makes them hesitant, silent, or even afraid of making mistakes when asked to speak. Here, vocabulary cards play an important role, especially when combined with the Think Pair Share learning model. Vocabulary cards can serve as a bridge between passive knowledge and active skills. Students who initially only know words passively can be trained to use them in spoken sentences. For example, with a card showing a verb (فعل), students can practice forming simple sentences, then develop them into conversations. The use of the Think Pair Share model based on vocabulary card media is not only a technical solution to vocabulary limitations but also a pedagogical strategy capable of improving students' speaking skills gradually, naturally, and enjoyably.

This research is conducted to fill the empirical gap regarding the application of cooperative learning models in the context of madrasahs, especially Arabic. The main focus is to evaluate the extent to which the Think Pair Share model based on vocabulary cards can respond to the distinctive challenges in teaching *maharah kalam*, such as low oral participation, limited vocabulary, and lack of speaking confidence. In addition, the research aims to assess the influence of this model on various aspects of language skills and to identify internal and external factors that support or hinder its implementation in

the classroom. Thus, the research results are expected to enrich the pedagogical discourse in Arabic teaching as well as provide practical recommendations for madrasah teachers in designing effective learning strategies suited to their students' characteristics.

The learning process has its own challenges compared to other foreign languages, both in terms of students' backgrounds, learning goals, and the availability of supporting media. Therefore, this research is significant because empirical testing of the Think Pair Share model based on vocabulary cards not only provides concrete evidence of its effectiveness but also enriches pedagogical studies on how cooperative learning theory can be applied contextually in the classroom. The findings are expected to bridge the gap between theory and practice, and encourage innovations in Arabic language teaching that are more relevant to contemporary needs.

Think-Pair-Share

The Think Pair Share (TPS) learning model is a form of cooperative learning model designed to increase students' active engagement in the teaching and learning process. TPS was developed by Frank Lyman (1981) as one of the cooperative learning strategies. This model is designed to enhance student interaction and to build critical thinking as well as communication skills. The learning model consists of three core stages:

1. **Think** — students are given the opportunity to reflect and think independently about the answer to a problem.
2. **Pair** — students discuss in pairs, usually with the person sitting next to them, to compare and further develop the ideas they have thought of.
3. **Share** — each pair shares the results of their discussion with the entire class or a larger group so that there is a wider exchange of ideas (Shofiyani, 2024).

This model encourages students to be more active in communication, to develop analytical thinking skills, and to build effective collaboration. It also aims to create an inclusive learning atmosphere where every student has the opportunity to process information, compare ideas, and openly express their opinions. In Arabic language learning, the TPS approach has the potential to be a strategic alternative for improving students' speaking skills through a structured and enjoyable process.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

Several previous studies provide a consistent picture regarding the effectiveness of the Think Pair Share (TPS) strategy in Arabic language learning. A study conducted by (Zaid, Muhaimin, & Itsarrozani, 2024) emphasized that the TPS strategy enriches students' understanding of the material and fosters greater engagement, higher self-confidence, and noticeable fluency in their Arabic speaking skills. In its broader implications, the study highlights the effectiveness of the TPS method in enhancing pedagogical quality and students' linguistic competence within the framework of al-Mahārah al-Kalām (speaking skills).

This aligns with the findings of (Aprilia, U, & Rahmawati, 2021), who stated that the Think Pair Share model is an interactive and innovative learning approach. The TPS learning model allows students to work independently or collaboratively with peers, optimizing their participation in the learning process and providing opportunities to showcase their engagement to others. As a result, it was reported that there was an improvement in the learning of maharah kalam.

Furthermore, (Isnaini et al., 2024) expanded their study by combining Think Pair Share (TPS) with Numbered Head Together (NHT). Their research showed that students responded positively to this combined model as it was able to create an active, collaborative, and enjoyable learning atmosphere. Observational data also indicated improvements in students' Arabic language skills, particularly in terms of speaking confidence and communication fluency.

Thus, this series of prior studies provides a strong foundation that TPS, whether applied independently or integrated with other models, demonstrates significant effectiveness in enhancing Arabic language skills. However, most research has primarily focused on the context of Madrasah Aliyah or the use of combined methods, leaving room to further investigate the application of TPS supported by specific media, such as vocabulary cards, in the context of Madrasah Tsanawiyah.

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employed a quantitative method with a quasi-experimental design. The quantitative approach utilizes numerical data as the foundation for answering research questions. It emphasizes objective measurement, standardized procedures for data collection, and the application of statistical analysis to test hypotheses and explain observed phenomena (Waruwu, Puat, Utami, Yanti, & Rusydiana, 2025). Quasi-experimental research is a type of experimental study that involves the administration of a treatment, measurement of outcomes, and the use of experimental units, but without employing randomization in the assignment of groups. This approach is commonly used to compare the changes that occur as a result of the treatment applied (Abraham & Supriyati, 2022).

The quasi-experimental design was chosen to examine the effectiveness of the Think Pair Share (TPS) learning model combined with vocabulary card media in improving students' Arabic speaking skills (*maharah kalām*). Within this design, the research subjects were first administered a pretest, followed by the treatment (implementation of TPS using vocabulary cards), and finally a posttest to identify changes in performance.

Specifically, this study applied the One-Group Pretest–Posttest Design. The pretest, conducted before the treatment, provided an overview of students' initial abilities without intervention, though it may not fully reflect their natural condition. Differences between pretest and posttest scores could result not only from the treatment but also from other factors, such as students' natural development (*maturation*), prior experiences, or the effect of repeated testing (Hastjarjo, 2019).

This study was conducted at MTsN 1 Lamongan with 38 seventh-grade students as research subjects. Before the implementation of the learning model, the students were given a pretest to measure their initial Arabic vocabulary ability. After several meetings using the Think Pair Share (TPS) model, the students were given a posttest to determine the improvement that occurred. Data collection was carried out through an objective speaking test, in which students spoke in front of the class, designed to measure their mastery of Arabic speaking skills. The data obtained from the pretest and posttest results were analyzed using descriptive statistical analysis and the paired sample t-test to determine the significance of the difference in learning outcomes before and after treatment. In addition, the research instruments underwent a validation process by two

education experts through a review and revision stage based on the feedback received, ensuring that the instruments accurately measured the intended aspects. The results of this study are expected to demonstrate an improvement in students' mastery of Arabic vocabulary following the implementation of the Think Pair Share (TPS) model, thereby confirming the model's effectiveness in the context of Arabic language learning at MTsN 1 Lamongan.

The research hypotheses are formulated as follows:

- **H₀ (Null Hypothesis):** There is no significant difference between the pretest and posttest scores in the improvement of Arabic vocabulary using the Teams Games Tournament (TGT) model.
- **H₁ (Alternative Hypothesis):** There is a significant difference between the pretest and posttest scores in the improvement of Arabic vocabulary using the Teams Games Tournament (TGT) model.

4. RESULTS & DISCUSSION

The data analysis results show that the implementation of the Think Pair Share (TPS) learning model with the support of vocabulary card media had a significant effect on improving the speaking skills (*maharah kalām*) of seventh-grade students at MTsN 1 Lamongan.

Tabel 1. Paired Samples Statistics

		Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1	pretest	74.39	38	12.476	2.024
	posttest	89.58	38	8.294	1.345

In Table 1, the descriptive statistical results show that the students' mean score during the pretest was **74.39**, while after the treatment using the TPS model with vocabulary card media, the posttest score increased to **89.58**. This increase is descriptively significant, with an average difference of **15.19 points**. In addition, the reduction in the standard deviation from **12.476** to **8.294** indicates that the distribution of scores after treatment became more uniform, meaning that most students experienced an improvement in speaking ability with less variation. A paired-sample t-test was conducted to examine the significance of this improvement. The t-test results are as follows:

Table 2. Paired Samples Correlations

		N	Correlation	Sig.
Pair 1	pretest & posttest	38	.530	.001

Furthermore, Table 2 shows a positive correlation of **0.530** between the pretest and posttest scores. The significance value ($p = 0.001$) indicates that this relationship is statistically significant. This means that there is a fairly strong relationship between students' initial ability and their achievement after receiving the treatment. Students with high initial scores tended to continue performing well, and vice versa.

Tabel 3. Paired Samples Test

		Paired Differences							
		Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference		t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
					Lower	Upper			
Pair 1	pretest - posttest	-15.184	10.715	1.738	-18.706	-11.662	-8.736	37	.000

Table 3 presents the results of the paired-sample t-test to examine the significant difference between pretest and posttest scores. The test shows that there is a highly significant difference between pretest and posttest results. The calculated t-value ($t = -8.736$) far exceeds the critical t-value (approximately 2.03 at a significance level of 0.05 with $df = 37$), and the significance value $p = 0.000 < 0.05$, which means the null hypothesis is rejected.

Theoretically, the success of the TPS model in improving speaking skills can be explained through its three main stages (Think, Pair, Share):

1. **Think** provides students with the opportunity to process information and build ideas independently, training critical thinking skills and organizing their vocabulary.
2. **Pair** allows students to discuss ideas with a partner in a more comfortable and non-intimidating setting, thus encouraging speaking confidence, especially among usually passive students.
3. **Share** provides an opportunity for students to present ideas to the larger group, fostering speaking fluency, self-confidence, and the ability to construct communicative sentences.

The use of vocabulary card media within TPS serves as a visual reinforcement as well as an effective memory aid. Vocabulary cards help students recall new words, enrich their lexical repertoire, and connect them to appropriate sentence contexts.

The findings of this study align with (Hidayah, 2019), who stated that TPS is an effective way to create varied classroom discussions, and support the argument of (Kasan, Rajalani, Batalipu, Isilah, & Damhuri, 2025), who emphasized that vocabulary card media can enhance students' interest in learning Arabic. Thus, it can be concluded that the TPS model assisted by vocabulary cards is effective in improving students' speaking skills. This effectiveness is reflected in:

- The significant increase in mean scores (a difference of 15.19 points).
- The more even distribution of scores after treatment.
- The statistically significant test results ($p < 0.05$).

Practically, these results imply that Arabic language teachers at the *Madrasah Tsanawiyah* level can adopt the TPS model with vocabulary card media as a teaching strategy to improve *maharah kalām*. This method not only encourages student participation but also helps them overcome limited vocabulary and fear of speaking in public. The in-depth discussion shows that TPS helps students think independently, engage in pair discussions, and speak confidently in front of the class. Vocabulary cards enrich their vocabulary so that they can express themselves with greater confidence.

This study also reaffirms the importance of pedagogical innovation in the context of madrasahs, where limited vocabulary often becomes a major barrier in mastering *maharah kalām*. Teachers can utilize TPS combined with vocabulary cards as an interactive and enjoyable alternative strategy, aligned with the spirit of the *Merdeka Curriculum*. These findings also reinforce previous studies (Aprilia et al., 2021; Isnaini et al., 2024; Zaid et al., 2024), which emphasized the effectiveness of TPS in enhancing students' participation and speaking skills.

The broader implication of this study is the need for cooperative learning models supported by media in Arabic language classes, particularly in madrasahs, as an effort to bridge the gap between pedagogical theory and classroom practice. This study also opens opportunities for further development, such as combining TPS and vocabulary cards with digital technology or other interactive media, thereby responding to the demands of 21st-century learning. Thus, this study is not only relevant at the practical level but also contributes to the development of cooperative learning theory within the context of language education in Indonesia.

5. CONCLUSION

This study was conducted with the aim of evaluating the effectiveness of implementing the Think Pair Share (TPS) learning model supported by vocabulary card media in improving the speaking skills (*maharah kalām*) of seventh-grade students at MTsN 1 Lamongan. Based on the results of data analysis, it was found that the TPS model combined with vocabulary cards had a significant effect on students' speaking ability. This was demonstrated by the increase in the mean score from **74.39** in the pretest to **89.58** in the posttest, with a difference of **15.19 points**. The t-test results also reinforced this conclusion with a value of **-8.736** and a significance level of **0.000 (< 0.05)**, which means that the null hypothesis was rejected.

These findings indicate that learning with the TPS model not only expands students' vocabulary mastery but also improves their confidence, active participation, and fluency in communicating in Arabic. Thus, this model has proven effective as an alternative teaching strategy that can be applied by teachers in developing students' speaking skills in madrasahs. Nevertheless, this study has limitations, as it involved only one class using a pre-experimental design. Therefore, future research is recommended to involve larger and more diverse samples, as well as to compare the effectiveness of TPS with other cooperative learning models such as Jigsaw, TGT, or Numbered Head Together. In addition, further studies could also explore the integration of TPS with other learning media, such as digital media or interactive applications, to yield more comprehensive results. Longitudinal studies are also important to investigate the long-term impact of TPS with vocabulary cards on students' language development. With these findings, this study can serve as a reference point for teachers and future researchers in developing Arabic language learning strategies that are more innovative, communicative, and aligned with students' needs.

REFERENCES

- Abraham, I., & Supriyati, Y. (2022). Quasi-Experimental Design In Education: Literature Review. *Mandala Education Scientific Journal*, 8(3), 2476–2482.
- Ahmad, Z. A. (2015). Pengembangan Model Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab Berbasis Teori Multiple Intelligence. *Al Mahāra: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab*, 1(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.14421/almahara.2015.011-01>
- Aprilia, K., U, A. T., & Rahmawati, S. (2021). Model Pembelajaran Think Pair Share Untuk Meningkatkan Penguasaan Maharah Kalam Pada Siswa Madrasah Aliyah. *Seminar Nasional Bahasa Arab Mahasiswa V Tahun 2021*, 607–618. Retrieved from file:///D:/Documents/jurnal/januari 8.pdf
- Hastjarjo, T. D. (2019). Rancangan Eksperimen-Kuasi. *Buletin Psikologi*, 27(2), 187. <https://doi.org/10.22146/buletinpsikologi.38619>
- Hidayah, F. (2019). Efektivitas Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Think Pair Share Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Bahasa Arab Siswa Madrasah Ibtidaiyyah. *Studi Arab*, 10(1), 39–56. <https://doi.org/10.35891/sa.v10i1.1766>
- Isnaini, F., Safitriani, I., & Dariyadi, M. W. (2024). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Think Pair Share dan Numbered Head Together dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab. *Kalimatuna: Journal of Arabic Research*, 3(2), 111–120. <https://doi.org/10.15408/kjar.v3i2.45959>
- Kasan, Y., Rajalani, S., Batalipu, A., Isilah, A., & Damhuri. (2025). Peningkatan Minat Belajar Bahasa Arab Melalui Penggunaan Media Kartu Mufradat Pada Siswa Kelas V MIS Al Huda Kota Gorontalo. *Al-Kilmah: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Dan Humaniora*, 4(1), 43–54. <https://doi.org/10.58194/al-kilmah.v4i1.2820>
- Khasanah, N. (2016). Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab Sebagai Bahasa Kedua (Uregensi Bahasa Arab Dan Pembelajarannya Di Indonesia). *An-Nidzam : Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Dan Studi Islam*, 3(2), 39–54. <https://doi.org/10.33507/an-nidzam.v3i2.16>
- Lestari, H., Rahman, A., & Asri, W. K. (2023). EFEKTIVITAS MEDIA FLASH CARD TERHADAP PENGUASAAN KOSAKATA BAHASA ARAB SISWA KELAS XI MADRASAH ALIYAH AWALUDDIN KUO KABUPATEN MAMUJU TENGAH. *Al-Fashahah : Journal of Arabic Education , Linguistics , and Literature*, 2(1), 10–17.
- Nasution, N. S., & Lubis, L. (2023). Urgensi Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab dalam Pendidikan Islam. *Jurnal Simki Pedagogia*, 6(1), 181–191. <https://doi.org/10.29407/jsp.v6i1.227>
- Norlianti, N., Riadi, A., Sapitri, E., & Rabiatal Aliyah, S. (2024). Pemanfaatan Media Kartu Kosakata untuk Meningkatkan Keterampilan Berbicara Bahasa Arab Siswa Kelas IX A MTS Miftahul Ulum Anggana. *Jurnal Sosial Dan Sains*, 4(11), 1084–1092. <https://doi.org/10.59188/jurnalsosains.v4i11.27923>
- Nuryadin, R., Irfan, N., & Layinah, L. (2024). Systematic Literature Review: Strategi Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab Ilmu Sharaf Berdasarkan Teori Pembelajaran Terpadu. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Indonesia (JPPI)*, 4(4), 1371–1385. <https://doi.org/10.53299/jppi.v4i4.738>
- Sakdiah, N., & Sihombing, F. (2023). Problematika Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab dan Sastra Arab. *Jurnal Sathar: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Arab*, 1(1), 35.
- Waruwu, M., Puat, S. N., Utami, P. R., Yanti, E., & Rusydiana, M. (2025). Metode penelitian kuantitatif: Konsep, jenis, tahapan dan kelebihan. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, 10(1), 917–932.

Ade Rizky Hermawan & Ainun Syarifah, *The Effectiveness of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) Learning Model Based on Vocabulary Cards to Improve Arabic Speaking Skills*

Zaid, A. H. bin, Muhaimin, Z. A., & Itsarrozan, A. F. (2024). Implementasi Strategi Think-Pair-Share dalam Meningkatkan al-Mahārah al Kalām di Kelas VIII MTsN 1 Madiun. *Al Mahāra Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab*, 10(2), 213–227. <https://doi.org/10.14421/almahara.2024>.